

# <sup>1</sup> **North-South Asymmetry in Martian Crater Slopes**

R. A. Parsons and F. Nimmo

<sup>2</sup> Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Santa

<sup>3</sup> Cruz, California, USA

---

R. A. Parsons, Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Santa Cruz, 1156 High St., Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA. (rparsons@pmc.ucsc.edu)

F. Nimmo, Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Santa Cruz, 1156 High St., Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA. (fnimmo@pmc.ucsc.edu)

4 **Abstract.** The presence of an extensive ice-rich layer in the near sub-  
5 surface of the Martian regolith can result in viscous creep responsible for soft-  
6 ening craters at mid and high latitudes. The temperature of ground ice will  
7 vary spatially within a crater due the effect of slope on the effective angle  
8 of insolation. The temperature at a particular latitude will also vary tem-  
9 porally due to changes in Mars' obliquity. Results from numerical simula-  
10 tions of viscous creep indicate that these temperature variations cause the  
11 pole-facing slopes of craters to be systematically steeper than those of equator-  
12 facing slopes. Crater slopes should be most asymmetric between 25 and 40  
13 degrees latitude, depending on the thickness of the creeping layer. This slope  
14 asymmetry predicted from theoretical simulations of regolith creep is not well  
15 developed in observed Martian crater topography. MOLA topography of craters  
16 16 to 40 km in diameter was analyzed for north-south slope asymmetry within  
17 five latitude regions ranging from 60°S to 60°N. Based on the lack of any sys-  
18 tematic slope asymmetry observed in the craters, we can place a conserva-  
19 tive upper limit of  $\sim 1.2$  km on the thickness of the ice-rich creeping layer  
20 assuming a volumetric dust content of 70% and an exponentially increasing  
21 soil viscosity with depth. If the creeping layer contains relatively clean ice,  
22 then the thickness of ice-rich material is limited to  $\sim 600$  m or less based on  
23 our results. The observations also suggest that the thickness of this creep-  
24 ing layer is reduced by a factor of  $\sim 2$  towards the equator.

## 1. Introduction

25 The Martian subsurface is arguably the largest reservoir for H<sub>2</sub>O on the planet. Based on  
26 thermophysical models, *Clifford* [1993] suggested that the Martian cryosphere could easily  
27 extend to 5 km depth globally. Given a surface porosity of 20%, a 5 km deep cryosphere  
28 amounts to a volume of water that could cover Mars in a 540 m deep global ocean.  
29 Constraining the thickness of the ice-rich regolith on Mars through geologic observations  
30 and remote sensing will allow for better estimates of the water budget.

31 Although direct evidence of water ice in the upper meter of the Martian subsurface has  
32 only recently been provided by neutron and gamma-ray spectrometer data and thermal  
33 emission observations [*Boynton et al.*, 2002; *Feldman et al.*, 2004; *Bandfield*, 2007], its  
34 presence had been strongly suspected since the Viking missions on both theoretical and  
35 observational grounds. Remote sensing observations [*Mustard et al.*, 2001] and numerical  
36 climate models [*Fanale et al.*, 1998; *Paige*, 1992; *Mellon et al.*, 1997] suggest that equa-  
37 torial regions are generally depleted in near-surface ice, while an ice-rich mantle extends  
38 poleward of 30°.

39 To probe for ice at greater depths, we rely on remote sensing observations from radar  
40 reflectometry and on geological observations such as topographic roughness, crater soft-  
41 ening, viscous flow features, and rampart ejecta. The only Mars radar results published  
42 to date are by *Plaut et al.* [2007] in which the thickness of the south polar layered deposits  
43 are measured at a thickness of 3 km. Future radar observations will likely constrain the  
44 thickness and distribution of ice-rich regolith at lower latitude. Global surface roughness  
45 measurements were made by *Kreslavsky and Head* [2003]. Their work suggests topo-

46 graphic relaxation has occurred at short wavelengths in mid-latitudes, possibly due to  
47 creep of ice-rich regolith. Ice-rich regolith creep may also be responsible for the observed  
48 north-south asymmetry in slopes at  $\sim 300$  m length-scales [*Kreslavsky and Head, 2000*].  
49 Relaxation of a deformable, presumably ice-rich, regolith layer of approximately 1 km in  
50 thickness may explain softened craters at mid to high latitude according to *Jankowski and*  
51 *Squyres* [1992]. The presence of lobate debris aprons and viscous flow features provide  
52 additional evidence for a large reservoir of ice-rich material in the near-surface of the Mar-  
53 tian regolith [*Colaprete and Jakosky, 1998; Mangold et al., 2002; Milliken et al., 2001*].  
54 Lobate ejecta deposits surrounding craters on Mars provide evidence for water ice in the  
55 near subsurface [*Strom et al., 1992*]. *Kuzmin et al.* [1988, 1989] found a strong latitudinal  
56 dependence regarding the onset diameter of craters with rampart ejecta. They suggest  
57 that this latitudinal dependence reflects an enrichment of ice in the Martian regolith with  
58 increasing latitude.

59 Here we investigate crater relaxation as a probe of the thickness of the inferred subsur-  
60 face ice-rich layer. Building on work by *Kreslavsky and Head* [2003] and *Jankowski and*  
61 *Squyres* [1992] we explore crater slope asymmetry as a means of determining the thick-  
62 ness of ice-rich regolith on Mars. First, we develop a theoretical model for crater slope  
63 asymmetry generation via viscous relaxation of crater topography. Next, we describe the  
64 method by which we analyzed real craters using Mars orbiter laser altimeter (MOLA) data  
65 [*Smith et al., 2001*]. In the subsequent section we compare crater relaxation simulation  
66 results to the observations from various latitude regions on Mars in order to constrain the  
67 model parameters. Finally, we discuss the model and observational results regarding the  
68 thickness of ice-rich material in the Martian regolith and present our conclusions.

## 2. Theory

### 2.1. Downslope Creep of Ice-Rich Regolith

Downslope transport of ice-rich Martian regolith may be modeled as a diffusion creep process which smooths out topographic variations over time [Colaprete and Jakosky, 1998; Perron et al., 2003; Pathare et al., 2005]. Crater softening due to ice-driven creep may vary spatially within a single crater due to temperature variations induced by slope-related insolation variations. Because creep processes are more rapid at higher temperature, one would expect equator-facing crater slopes to creep more and become shallower than pole-facing slopes at low to moderate obliquities. The relaxation of topography ( $h$ ) is governed by the thickness of the ice-rich layer, the viscosity at the surface ( $\eta_{sfc}$ ) of the creeping layer, and the local slope. In order to minimize computation time, we make the simplifying assumption that the viscosity of the ice-rich Martian regolith increases exponentially with depth as follows:

$$\eta(z) = \eta_{sfc} \left( e^{z/\delta} \right) \quad (1)$$

where  $z$  is depth, increasing downward and the  $e$ -folding depth ( $\delta$ ) of viscosity will hereafter be referred to as the thickness of the creeping layer. Viscosity models presented by Jankowski and Squyres [1992] assumed either a constant viscosity with depth, or an exponentially decreasing viscosity with depth. The latter of these models assumed the Martian geotherm had a dominant effect on the regolith rheology at depth. Here we assume that a decrease in the ice volume fraction with depth dominates the regolith rheology, resulting in an exponentially increasing regolith viscosity with depth. The viscosity

at the surface of the creeping layer is given by

$$\eta_{sfc} = \eta_o \left[ e^{\frac{Q(T-T_m)}{RTT_m} + b\phi} \right] \quad (2)$$

(modified from *Pathare et al.* [2005]) where  $Q$  is the activation energy,  $R$  is the ideal gas constant,  $T$  is the local temperature,  $T_m$  is 273 K,  $\eta_o$  is the viscosity of polycrystalline ice at 273 K,  $\phi$  is the dust fraction, and  $b$  is a constant [*Durham et al.*, 1992]. Assuming the viscosity structure given above, a Newtonian rheology, and a constant ice-rich layer thickness, the following equation for the change in topography with time may be derived:

$$\frac{\partial h}{\partial t} = 2\delta^3 \rho g \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \left( \frac{1}{\eta_{sfc}} \frac{\partial h}{\partial x} \right) \quad (3)$$

where  $\rho$  is the density of the creeping layer and  $g$  is gravity. The derivation of equation 3 is given in Appendix A and the values of the parameters used in equations 2 and 3 are listed in Table 1. A viscosity of  $10^{14}$  Pa s is appropriate for ice of 1.0 mm grainsize at 273 K (extrapolated from *Goldsby and Kohlstedt* [2001]). In our numerical simulations we consider  $\phi$  values that range from 0 (dust-free ice) to the critical fraction at which the viscosity of a rock-ice mixture will be rock-dominated ( $\phi = 0.72$ ) [*Mangold et al.*, 2002].

Table 1

## 2.2. Numerical Model

We modeled the relaxation of topography using a finite-difference discretization of equation 3 in which the only initial topographic variation is due to a single peak-to-peak sinusoidal curve. The peak-to-peak distance is the crater diameter ( $D$ ), and the initial depth is set to  $D/15$ . This depth to diameter ratio was based on the maximum ratio observed in our analysis of crater topography and gives craters that are  $\sim 40\%$  deeper than the depth to diameter relationship given by *Garvin and Frawley* [1998] for craters 30 km in diameter. The motivation for using a depth to diameter ( $d/D$ ) ratio of 1/15 will be

discussed in Section 5.2. Parabolic crater profiles were also used as an initial condition, but only sinusoidal results are presented in this paper for reasons that will be discussed in Section 5.1. The topographic profile, with the initial sinusoidal crater at the center, is divided into 1000 elements, each 100 m in length. The time step used in the simulation is 1000 yrs.

### 2.3. Influence of Obliquity and Slope on Temperature

The latitude, local slope, and obliquity all influence the local temperature. We determine the temperature of a horizontal surface on Mars at a given obliquity using theoretical insolation calculations by *Ward* [1974]. The annual average equatorial temperature on Mars is currently 220 K [*Mellon and Jakosky*, 1995]. This temperature corresponds to an insolation of 180 Wm<sup>-2</sup> based on calculations by *Ward* [1974]. We can relate insolation values at other latitudes to temperature using the following relation:

$$T_{horiz} = \left( \frac{I}{180} \right)^{1/4} 220K \quad (4)$$

where  $T_{horiz}$  is the temperature of a horizontal surface and  $I$  is the local insolation in Wm<sup>-2</sup> given by *Ward* [1974]. Figure 1 shows how temperature varies both as a function of latitude and obliquity in our simulations. In simulations lasting less than or equal to 10 Myrs, we allow obliquity to vary with time based on the recent obliquity history from *Laskar et al.* [2002]. For longer-term simulations, we use a statistical approach. The obliquity at a particular 1000 yr time step in the 100 Myr and 250 Myr simulations is randomly selected based on a gaussian distribution of obliquities given for the appropriate time into the Martian past (either 100 Myrs or 250 Myrs) determined by *Laskar et al.* [2004]. We assume the effect of slope is to change the local latitude by the angle of the slope. While

Figure 1

not exactly correct, this assumption is a good approximation of more complicated approaches (e.g. *Aharonson and Schorghofer* [2006]). For example, an equator-facing slope  $\theta$  at a latitude  $\phi$  is assigned a temperature of a latitude  $(\phi - \theta)$ . Before discussing the results from these simulations, we will first describe how we quantified slope asymmetry of craters in both the simulations and in the MOLA topography.

## 2.4. Slope Asymmetry

Based on the theory outlined above, we expect regolith creep to result in craters demonstrating a slope asymmetry with shallower equator-facing slopes than pole-facing slopes. We quantify the slope asymmetry in a similar fashion to *Kreslavsky and Head* [2003] by using the parameter

$$A = \frac{S_n - S_s}{S_{ave}} \quad (5)$$

where  $S_n$  and  $S_s$  are the maximum slopes on the north and south faces of the crater, respectively. In the simulations  $S_{ave}$  is the mean maximum slope for the two faces. A negative value for  $A$  indicates that the south face of the crater is steeper in slope than the north face. In the next section we describe the method used to measure crater slope asymmetry on Mars using gridded topography from MOLA.

## 3. Method of Crater Analysis

We used four criteria to select craters on Mars for slope asymmetry analysis. First, craters were chosen from five latitude bands, centered on: 60°N, 1.5°S, 20°S, 30°S, and 60°S. The locations of these regions are listed in Table 2. Second, we selected craters based on size, ranging from 16 to 40 km in diameter. Our analysis requires craters that are large enough to be resolved in gridded MOLA topography, and small enough so that

150 no central peak is observed. Another criterion used in crater selection was freshness.  
151 We avoided overprinted craters, or craters with heavily modified rims. Finally, craters  
152 on steep regional slopes were not included in our survey to avoid potential bias in the  
153 calculation of  $A$ .

154 We measured crater slope asymmetry using 18 radial topographic profiles taken every  
155 20 degrees of azimuth overlain on gridded MOLA topography at a pixel resolution of  
156 460 m (Figure 2a). Each profile extends from the center of the crater to the crater rim,  
157 or just beyond the rim. The topography was interpolated at a resolution of 375 m for all  
158 profiles. Four profiles transect the north and south crater faces and 5 profiles transect the  
159 east and west faces. For each crater face we averaged the appropriate profiles together  
160 to get a stacked profile (Figure 2b). We then compared the maximum slopes from the  
161 north and south crater faces using the stacked profiles to determine slope asymmetry. The  
162 crater slope asymmetry is quantified by the parameter  $A$ , where  $A = (S_n - S_s)/S_{ew}$  where  
163  $S_{ew}$  is the average of the maximum slopes from the stacked east and west profiles. The  
164 quantification of slope asymmetry in crater topography, above, is slightly different than  
165 equation 5 because the topography is 3D and the simulations are done in 2D.

Figure 2

#### 4. Results

166 We use a 100 Myr simulation time as an assumed minimum age of craters 16 to 40 km  
167 diameter on Mars. The crater chronology of Amazonis Planitia presented by *Hartmann*  
168 *and Neukum* [2001] suggest craters 16 to 40 km diameter give a surface age of  $\sim 1$  Gyr.  
169 Assuming a constant cratering rate, the average crater age would be 500 Myrs. Even  
170 though we are concentrating on the least degraded craters, we can assume most craters  
171 of this size are older than 100 Myrs. Running  $> 1$  Gyr simulation times would be in-

172 appropriate given the current uncertainties associated with long-term climate evolution  
173 on Mars. Results from 100 Myr simulations will give conservatively high estimates of  
174 the ice-rich creeping layer thickness if we are underestimating the true crater age. The  
175 majority of our simulations model 100 and 250 Myr of crater relaxation.

#### 4.1. An Example Simulation

176 We calculate the theoretical change in topography of an initial crater profile over time  
177 using equations 1 through 4 with specified values for latitude,  $\delta$ , and  $\phi$ . The background  
178 surface temperature varies with time in the simulation due to the changing obliquity, as  
179 discussed in Section 2.3. An example of a modeled topographic profile is shown in Figure  
180 3a for a 25 km diameter crater at 25° latitude with  $\delta = 600$  m and  $\phi = 0.2$  over a 10 Myr  
181 period. Notice the pronounced asymmetry in slope that has developed in the final profile  
182 due to the hastening of creep on the equator-facing slope (right hand side of crater). The  
183 value of  $|A|$  in Figure 3a is 0.325. Figure 3b shows how the temperature along the initial  
184 and final profiles varies due to the effect of slope on the angle of incident sunlight. The  
185 shift in the regional temperature between the two profiles is due to a change in obliquity  
186 from 34.5° 10 Myr ago to 25° at present [*Laskar et al., 2002*]. The model results shown  
187 in Figure 3 are simply examples; in general, simulations used an elapsed time of 100 Myr  
188 based on conservative estimates of likely crater ages (see above).

Figure 3

#### 4.2. 100 Myr Simulation Results

189 Figure 4 summarizes the result of 100 Myr simulations in which latitude and  $\delta$  are  
190 varied. The simulation results show that at high latitudes surface temperatures are too  
191 cold and flow is so slow that no significant asymmetry develops. At mid latitudes the

Figure 4

192 regional temperature is higher relative to the poles. Also, the temperature difference  
193 between the two slopes is significant due the differences in insolation between the north  
194 and south crater faces. The result is a local maximum in asymmetry at between  $25^\circ$   
195 and  $45^\circ$  latitude, depending on the value for  $\delta$ . Finally, near the equator, temperature is  
196 approximately the same for the north and south crater faces so no asymmetry can develop.  
197 As expected, the rate of flow and thus the development of asymmetry is a strong function  
198 of  $\delta$  (equation 3). One important result from these simulations is the decrease in  $|A|$  at  
199 low to mid-latitudes when the ice-rich layer thickness is increased from 600 m to 1000 m.  
200 This decrease in  $|A|$  is a result of craters relaxing to the point that the opposing crater  
201 faces become more similar in slope with time. Thus, highly relaxed craters will have a  
202 lower value of  $|A|$  than moderately relaxed craters. This effect will be discussed further  
203 in Section 4.5.

Table 2.

### 4.3. Observational Results

204 The observed crater slope asymmetry in the five regions we analyzed is summarized in  
205 Table 2. In no case was a mean value of  $|A|$  obtained that differed significantly from zero,  
206 indicating that the predicted systematic slope asymmetries (Figure 4) are not observed.  
207 Figure 5 compares the observed crater slope asymmetry to results from topographic re-  
208 laxation simulations lasting 100 Myrs. The colored dots are measured slope asymmetries  
209 for individual craters. The black squares and vertical lines indicate the mean and  $\pm 1$   
210 standard deviation in  $A$ , respectively, for craters in a given latitude region. As shown  
211 in Figure 5, there is no statistically significant slope asymmetry at any of the latitude  
212 regions we analyzed. This observation provides an upper limit on the extent to which  
213 creep has occurred. Since the creep rate depends mainly on  $\delta$  and  $\phi$ , the characteristics

214 of any creeping ice-rich layer present can therefore be constrained. The black curves in  
 215 Figure 5 show the expected asymmetry signal for a 30 km diameter crater evolving over  
 216 a 100 Myr period for various creeping layer thicknesses with  $\phi = 0.2$ . The dashed line  
 217 shows results from simulations with a higher dust fraction ( $\phi = 0.7$ ) and a 1.2 km thick  
 218 deformable layer. These results show that the mid-latitude slope asymmetry observations  
 219 provide the strongest constraint on the creeping layer characteristics. The  $\delta = 600$  m,  
 220  $\phi = 0.2$  curve and the curve with  $\delta = 1.2$  km and  $\phi = 0.7$  fail to fit within one standard  
 221 deviation of the observations. These combinations of  $\phi$  and  $\delta$  provide an upper bound on  
 222 the creeping layer characteristics. As expected, there is a trade-off between  $\delta$  and  $\phi$  in  
 223 generating crater slope asymmetry. As will be discussed in Section 4.5, longer timescale  
 224 simulations will result in tighter constraints on  $\delta$  and  $\phi$  as one would expect.

Figure 5

#### 4.4. Trade-offs Between $\delta$ , $\phi$ , and Simulation Time in Generating Slope Asymmetry

225 To further explore the trade-off between  $\delta$ ,  $\phi$ , and creep duration we carried out a suite  
 226 of runs lasting 10 and 100 Myr. These simulations used values for  $\delta$  and  $\phi$  that ranged  
 227 from 200 m to 1000 m and from 0.2 to 0.8, respectively. Based on the observed slope  
 228 asymmetries (Figure 5), runs that produced slope asymmetry values for mid-latitudes  
 229 ( $40^\circ$ ) with  $|A| < 0.2$  were deemed consistent with the observations. The tick-marked lines  
 230 in Figure 6 show the domain of  $\delta$ ,  $\phi$ , and creep duration that give a slope asymmetry value  
 231 of 0.2 or less. As expected, a longer simulation duration results in tighter constraints on  
 232  $\delta$  and  $\phi$ . For a given value of  $|A|$ , higher values of  $\phi$  permit larger thicknesses  $\delta$ , and  
 233 vice versa. For 100 Myr simulations with a dust fraction near the viscous transition to a  
 234 solid particle rheology  $\phi \approx 0.7$  [Mangold *et al.*, 2002] give a maximum layer thickness of

Figure 6

235  $\sim 1$  km. A smaller dust fraction ( $\phi = 0.2$ ) results in a correspondingly smaller maximum  
236 layer thickness ( $\sim 0.35$  km). For the 250 Myr simulations these maximum layer thicknesses  
237 are reduced to  $\sim 0.8$  km and  $\sim 0.25$  km, respectively.

#### 4.5. 250 Myr Simulation Results

238 Our longest crater relaxation simulations lasted 250 Myrs. We chose reasonable values  
239 for  $\delta$  and  $\phi$  (1200 m and 0.5, respectively) based on the shorter simulations. Initial and  
240 final topography and slope of this simulation are shown in Figure 7a and b, respectively.  
241 The evolution of crater asymmetry (solid line) and depth to diameter ratio (dotted line)  
242 during the simulation is shown in Figure 7c. The reason for the decrease in  $A$  after  
243 100 Myrs of simulation time is due to the shallow slopes present in a very relaxed crater.  
244 Once the crater has infilled beyond about one quarter of its original depth the slope  
245 asymmetry begins to decrease with time as shown in Figure 7c. This decrease in  $|A|$  for  
246 highly softened craters is due to a reduction in the creep rate at low slopes (equation 3).  
247 After about one quarter of the crater has been infilled, the shallower of the two crater  
248 slopes experiences a slowed creep rate due to its low slope, allowing the creep process  
249 on the other crater face to catch up. As the crater topography continues to relax, the  
250 two slopes become more similar, resulting in a decrease in  $|A|$ . Because highly relaxed  
251 craters have a low  $|A|$  value, 250 Myrs simulations with a large  $\delta$  and small  $\phi$  result in  
252 craters that satisfy the  $|A| < 0.2$  agreement with the observations. However, as will be  
253 discussed later in this section, observed  $d/D$  ratios for the craters we analysed suggest  
254 highly relaxed craters are not found in the regions and size range that we analyzed.

255 The simulations were carried out using a time-dependent obliquity calculated using the  
256 statistical approach described in Section 2 (Figure 7d). In this figure we plotted obliquity

Figure 7

every 100,000 yrs although it varied every time step (1000 yrs) in the simulation to make the plot readable. At high obliquity ( $>55^\circ$ ) the temperature of a horizontal surface gets warmer toward the poles [*Ward, 1974*] resulting in a reversal of the normal variation in creep rates. On average, however, the obliquity is about  $34^\circ$  over 100 to 250 Myr timescales [*Laskar et al., 2004*]. Thus, during most of the numerical simulation, the temperature is decreasing toward the poles resulting in craters with a negative value for  $A$  in the northern hemisphere and a positive value in the southern hemisphere.

As the crater infills during our simulations, the diameter increases as the creep flow softens the crater rim. The combination of infilling and crater widening cause the crater's  $d/D$  ratio to significantly decrease over time depending on the creep rate. Comparing  $d/D$  ratios from the numerical model and the observations places an additional constraint on the creep rate. Figure 8a shows  $d/D$  ratio plotted against  $A$  for both simulation results and observations. Although the simulation is for a crater at  $25^\circ\text{S}$  latitude, observations from all the latitude regions we analyzed are plotted to illustrate the range in observed  $d/D$  ratio. The colored boxes give mean values for  $A$  and  $d/D$  ratio for a particular latitude region with  $\pm 1$  standard deviation given by the error bars. The simulation starts with a  $d/D$  ratio of 0.067 which decreases with time as the crater relaxes. The cross-hairs are separated by 25 Myr of simulation time;  $\delta = 1200$  m and  $\phi = 0.5$  in this 250 Myr simulation. The end-point of the simulation shown in Figure 8a has  $|A| \approx 0.2$  and a  $d/D$  ratio much lower than the observed craters. The lack of low  $d/D$  ratio craters on Mars suggests few 16-40 km diameter craters have relaxed to the degree shown in Figure 7 or 8a.

Figure 8

279 A  $d/D$  ratio versus  $A$  plot for a crater relaxation simulation at  $60^\circ\text{S}$  is compared to  
280 observations from  $60^\circ\text{S}$  and  $60^\circ\text{N}$  in Figure 8b. The negative of the mean  $A$  value for  
281  $60^\circ\text{N}$  is plotted here in order to compare it with the southern latitude simulation. This  
282 simulation uses  $\delta = 600\text{m}$  and  $\phi = 0.5$ . Figure 8c gives a similar plot for a simulation  
283 at  $25^\circ\text{S}$  with  $\delta = 300\text{ m}$  and  $\phi = 0.5$ . Observations from  $30$  and  $20^\circ\text{S}$  are shown for  
284 comparison. In both cases the end-point of the simulation (250 Myr) produces values of  
285  $A$  and  $d/D$  ratio consistent with the observations.

## 5. Discussion

### 5.1. Summary of Results

286 The 100 Myr simulation results shown in Figure 6 suggest the ice-rich layer at  $40^\circ$   
287 latitude could be either 300 m in thickness for clean ice or, alternatively, 1 km thick with  
288 a dust fraction of 0.7. Given the range of asymmetries in the observations, values for  $\delta$  and  
289  $\phi$  are likely to be both spatially and temporally heterogeneous. At latitudes higher than  
290  $40^\circ$ , crater relaxation is slowed by colder temperatures and a thicker creeping layer will  
291 result in a north-south slope asymmetry that still lies within the range of the observations.

292 One result from the 250 Myr simulations is that the age of the crater is important in de-  
293 termining the slope asymmetry that we observe today. Figure 7 shows that the maximum  
294 slope asymmetry occurs after about 100 Myrs of topographic relaxation. Subsequently,  
295 the slope asymmetry slowly decreases as more material infills the crater. The time at  
296 which the maximum asymmetry is reached depends on the size of the crater, the thick-  
297 ness of the creeping layer, the dust fraction, and latitude. The faster the creep of regolith,  
298 the sooner the maximum slope asymmetry will be reached. Based on the observed  $d/D$   
299 ratios, the craters we analyzed on Mars have not relaxed so much that the slope asymme-

try is decreasing with time (Figure 8a). Rather, the observed slope asymmetry is occurring  
in the early stage of crater softening. Figure 8b suggests, for a dust fraction of 0.5, that a  
creeping layer thickness of 600 m gives values of  $A$  and  $d/D$  ratio that are in close agree-  
ment with the observations at  $60^\circ$  latitude. At lower latitude simulations with a creeping  
layer thickness of 300 m and  $\phi = 0.5$  match the observed  $d/D$  ratios and  $A$  values (Figure  
8c). A thickening creeping layer toward the poles is supported by cryosphere models put  
forth by *Clifford* [1993]; *Fanale et al.* [1998], and *Kuzmin et al.* [1989].

## 5.2. Model Assumptions

Our numerical model is less sophisticated than that used by *Pathare et al.* [2005] (al-  
though the basic physics is the same); the advantage of our simpler model is the ability  
to explore parameter space rapidly. We assume an exponentially increasing viscosity with  
depth attributed to the incorporation of more rocky material and a decrease in pore space  
(equation 1). We also assume a linear relationship between shear stress and shear strain  
rate. Although ice can deform in a non-Newtonian manner, debris apron modeling by  
*Mangold and Allemand* [2001] suggests that assuming a Newtonian rheology may be ap-  
propriate. Ice is assumed to be present at/within the surface during the simulations,  
extending to a constant depth scaled according to the creeping layer thickness. As de-  
scribed in *Mellon and Jakosky* [1995], surface ice is currently unstable at latitudes less  
than  $\sim 60^\circ$ , resulting in a dessicated layer extending a few meters into the Martian re-  
golith. However, these authors also show that surface ice is stable at all locations on Mars  
at obliquities  $> 32^\circ$ . The thickness of the dessicated layer is insignificant compared to  
the creeping layer thicknesses ( $\sim 1$  km) used in our simulations, and will have a negli-  
gible effect on its rheology. The presence of ice deep within the Martian subsurface has

322 been suggested by *Clifford* [1993], extending to perhaps 10 km. In this paper we have  
323 not accounted for where ice is, or was, stable in the Martian subsurface, rather we have  
324 simply modeled how craters would respond to ice-rich regolith creep assuming that it is  
325 present. One should keep in mind, however, that the instability of ice at the surface does  
326 not necessarily correlate with a lack of ice at depth.

327 Many of the assumptions used our numerical model were made to ensure that our  
328 estimate of the ice-rich layer thickness was an upper limit. For instance, we use a sinusoidal  
329 initial topographic profile instead of a parabolic profile because the slopes of the parabolic  
330 profile are more steep and result in a larger slope asymmetry as the parabolic profile begins  
331 to relax. In general, a larger creeping layer thickness generates more asymmetric crater  
332 slopes as long as the crater doesn't become significantly infilled (Figures 4 and 6). Using  
333 a sinusoidal initial profile forces the creeping layer to be thicker than it would be for a  
334 parabolic profile in order to produce the same slope asymmetry. Another conservative  
335 assumption used in our model is the viscosity at the surface of the ice-rich creeping layer  
336 ( $\eta_o$ ) and the vertical viscosity structure given by equation (2). The  $10^{14}$  Pas surface  
337 viscosity is for rather coarse-grained ice (1.0 mm) giving a higher creeping layer viscosity  
338 than would be present for finer grained ice. Assuming a relatively high viscosity slows the  
339 rate of crater relaxation - making our estimate for the creeping layer thickness an upper  
340 limit. We also limit the rate at which the craters relax by assuming an exponentially  
341 increasing viscosity with depth. In order to reproduce a softened crater, the creeping layer  
342 thickness must be greater using our viscosity structure than it would be for a viscosity  
343 structure with smaller depth variations or a lower surface value (smaller ice grain size).  
344 Finally, assuming a relatively large  $d/D$  ratio (compared to *Garvin and Frawley* [1998])

345 ensures that our creeping layer thickness is an upper limit. Although a larger  $d/D$  ratio  
346 results in steeper slopes, the creeping layer thickness must still be greater in order to  
347 produce a softened crater with a  $d/D$  ratio that lies within the range of observations  
348 (Figure 8).

349 Although we have accounted for obliquity variations in our simulations, we did not  
350 address the effect of a time dependent eccentricity, nor variations in the longitude of  
351 periapse. Both of these effects will have a smaller effect on the temperature distribution  
352 than obliquity variations [*Laskar et al.*, 2002].

### 5.3. Additional Remarks

353 There remain many questions regarding the mechanism by which craters are softened  
354 on Mars. For instance: why are no systematic crater slope asymmetries observed in any  
355 of the regions we studied on Mars, especially in the high latitude regions?

356 One possibility is that the ice-rich layer thickness varies spatially within a crater. At low  
357 to moderate obliquities the pole-facing crater slope is colder than the equator-facing slope.  
358 However, creep hastening on the warm slope might be subdued if the ice-rich layer is thin.  
359 If coupled with a thick creeping layer on the cold slope, the creep rates for the north and  
360 south slopes could be approximately equal - resulting in no slope asymmetry even though  
361 topographic relaxation proceeds. The preferential surface deposition of ice-rich mantling  
362 material on pole-facing slopes [*Aharonson and Schorghofer*, 2006] might also affect the  
363 topography and reduce the effective north-south topographic asymmetry. However, the  
364 thickness of mantling material required to change the slope on a 16 km diameter crater  
365 by  $5^\circ$  is about 700 m. This thickness seems unlikely given the 10 m mantling thickness  
366 estimates provided by *Mustard et al.* [2001]. One mechanism that does not appear able

367 to explain the observations is temperature variations induced by changes in obliquity.  
368 Although obliquity variations may affect topography at  $\sim 300$  m lengthscales [*Kreslavsky*  
369 *and Head, 2003*], our simulations (e.g. Figure 7) suggest that obliquity variations are  
370 not sufficient to override the formation of a north-south slope asymmetry in craters 16 to  
371 40 km in diameter.

## 6. Conclusions

372 Topographic observations of craters on Mars indicate that there is no statistically signif-  
373 icant dependence of crater slope asymmetry on latitude (Section 4.3, Table 2). Generally,  
374 slope asymmetry ranges between  $A = -0.2$  and  $A = 0.2$  in all of the five regions we ana-  
375 lyzed. Numerical models of crater relaxation using reasonable creeping layer thicknesses  
376 and dust fractions suggest that the formation of significant slope asymmetry occurs over  
377  $\sim 100$  Myr timescales. Comparison between topographic observations of craters on Mars  
378 and our numerical models suggest that a clean ice-rich layer on Mars does not extend  
379 deeper than 600 m. If the creeping layer responsible for crater softening on Mars contains  
380 50 - 70% dust per volume, then the creeping layer thickness could extend to 1200 m. At  
381 low latitude the creeping layer is likely thinner, perhaps 300 m or less, based on  $d/D$  ratio  
382 comparisons between the simulations and the observations (Figure 8). These thickness es-  
383 timates are conservative and would be lower if, for example, longer simulation times were  
384 used. Assuming a 600 m thick global near-surface, ice-rich layer incorporating a dust  
385 fraction of 0.2 accounts for  $\sim 6 \times 10^7$  km<sup>3</sup> of water. This upper-limit volume estimate is  
386 a factor of 3 smaller than the Noachian ocean volume proposed by *Clifford and Parker*  
387 [2001], but is in agreement with the end-state of the hydrosphere evolution model that  
388 these authors propose. The extent of the northern ocean proposed by *Baker et al.* [2000]

389 (reaching Olympus Mons) exceeds our upper limit water volume estimate by a factor of  
390 5. More modest-sized oceans [*Parker et al.*, 1989, 1993; *Carr and III*, 2003], extending to  
391 the outer Vastitas Borealis formation, are less than half of our estimated volume.

392 It is unclear why the mean crater slope asymmetry in a particular region is so close  
393 to zero. Most puzzling is the number of craters with values of  $A$  that are opposite in  
394 sign to what one would expect theoretically (Figure 5). A range of crater asymmetry  
395 values (of a given sign) within a particular region on Mars is expected because crater  
396 slope asymmetry evolves over time (Figure 7c). We expect there to be some scatter in  $A$   
397 due to the range of crater ages present within a particular region, but not a variation in  
398 sign as a result of creep-related processes. One possibility is simply that regolith creep is  
399 sufficiently slow (e.g. the creeping layer is thin) that this process is overwhelmed by other  
400 geological processes such as gully formation or tectonic deformation.

401 The strong dependence of crater softening on wavelength [*Jankowski and Squyres*, 1992;  
402 *Pathare et al.*, 2005] is another possible explanation of why no systematic crater asymme-  
403 tries are observed. Because short wavelength features will relax more quickly than longer  
404 wavelengths, it is possible that smaller craters than those we have examined will show  
405 systematic crater slope asymmetry. Alternatively, an increase in the creeping layer thick-  
406 ness on cold slopes coupled with a reduction of ice-rich material on warm slopes would  
407 significantly reduce the expected crater slope asymmetry.

408 **Acknowledgments.** We would like to acknowledge Mars Fundamental Research for  
409 granting funds for this research. We would also like to thank Mads Ellehoj for his prelim-  
410 inary work on this project.

## 7. Appendix A. Derivation of the Momentum Equation

Here we derive equation 3, which describes the relaxation of topography resulting from the flow of ice-rich regolith downslope. We assume an exponentially increasing viscosity with depth (equation 1), a Newtonian rheology, a constant e-folding viscosity depth  $\delta$ , and conservation of mass. The shear stress on a deforming viscous medium is given by:

$$\frac{\tau}{\eta} = \frac{\partial v}{\partial z} \quad (6)$$

where  $\tau$  is shear stress,  $\eta$  is the Newtonian viscosity and  $v$  is down-dip velocity. We choose a coordinate system in which  $v$  is oriented down-dip and  $z$  is perpendicular to the sloping surface, increasing downward. Topographic gradients result in shear stresses (given in differential form):

$$-\frac{\partial \tau}{\partial z} = \rho g \frac{\partial h}{\partial x} \quad (7)$$

where  $g$  is gravity,  $\rho$  is density of the ice-rock mixture, and  $h$  is elevation. Integrating equation (7) and substituting into (6) results in the following equation:

$$\frac{\partial v}{\partial z} = (\eta_{sfc})^{-1} e^{-z/\delta} \left( \rho g \frac{\partial h}{\partial x} z + c \right) \quad (8)$$

where  $c$  is a constant of integration and  $\eta_{sfc}$  is given by equation 2. Using  $\partial v/\partial z = 0$  at  $z = 0$  as a boundary condition  $c$  becomes 0. Integrating once more and applying the boundary condition that  $v = 0$  at  $z = \infty$  gives the expression for the vertical velocity field of downslope ice-rich regolith creep

$$v(z) = \frac{\rho g}{\eta_{sfc}} \frac{\partial h}{\partial x} \left[ \delta e^{-z/\delta} (z + \delta) \right]. \quad (9)$$

429 To translate this velocity field into a change in topography, we use the following conser-  
430 vation of mass relationship:

$$431 \quad \frac{\partial h}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \int_0^{\infty} v \partial z. \quad (10)$$

432 Finally, we combine equations (9) and (10) to obtain the momentum equation given in  
433 (3).

## References

- 434 Aharonson, O., and N. Schorghofer, Subsurface ice on Mars with rough topography, *J. of*  
435 *Geophys. Res.*, *111*, doi:10.1029/2005JE002636, 2006.
- 436 Baker, V., J. Dohm, V. Gulick, J. Kargel, G. Komatsu, and V. Kale, Oceanus borealis, an-  
437 cient glaciers and the megaoutflo hypothesis, *Lunar Planet. Sci. Conf.*, XXXI, Abstract  
438 1863, 2000.
- 439 Bandfield, J., High-resolution subsurface water-ice distributions on mars, *Nature*, *447*,  
440 64–68, 2007.
- 441 Boynton, W., W. Feldman, S. Squyres, and T. Prettyman, Distribution of hydrogen in  
442 the near surface of Mars: Evidence for subsurface ice deposits, *Science*, *297*, 81–85,  
443 2002.
- 444 Carr, M., and J. H. III, Oceans on Mars: An assessment of the observational evidence  
445 and possible fate, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *108*, doi:10.1029/2002JE001963, 2003.
- 446 Clifford, S., A model for the hydrologic and climatic behavior of water on Mars, *J. Geo-*  
447 *phys. Res.*, *98*, 10,973–11,016, 1993.
- 448 Clifford, S., and T. Parker, The evolution of the Martian hydrosphere: Implications for  
449 the fate of a primordial ocean and the current state of the northern plains, *Icarus*, *154*,

- 450 40–79, 2001.
- 451 Colaprete, A., and B. Jakosky, Ice flow and rock glaciers on Mars, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *103*,
- 452 5897–5909, 1998.
- 453 Durham, W., S. Kirby, and L. Stern, Effects of dispersed particulates on the rheology of
- 454 water ice at planetary conditions, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *97*, 20,883–20,897, 1992.
- 455 Fanale, F., J. Salvail, A. Zent, and S. Postawko, Global distribution and migration of
- 456 subsurface ice on Mars, *Icarus*, *67*, 1–18, 1998.
- 457 Feldman, W., T. Prettyman, S. Maurice, and J. Plaut, Global distribution of near-surface
- 458 hydrogen on Mars, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *109*, doi:10.1029/2003JE002160, 2004.
- 459 Garvin, J. B., and J. J. Frawley, Geometric properties of Martian impact craters: Prelimi-
- 460 nary results from the Mars Orbiter Laser Altimeter, *Geophys. Res. Let.*, *25*, 4405–4408,
- 461 1998.
- 462 Goldsby, D., and D. Kohlstedt, Superplastic deformation of ice: experimental observa-
- 463 tions, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *106*, 11,017–11,030, 2001.
- 464 Hartmann, W., and G. Neukum, *Cratering chronology and the evolution of Mars*, pp.
- 465 165–194, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001.
- 466 Jankowski, D., and S. Squyres, The topography of impact craters in "softened" terrain
- 467 on Mars, *Icarus*, *100*, 26–39, 1992.
- 468 Kreslavsky, M., and J. Head, Kilometer-scale roughness on Mars: Results from mola data
- 469 analysis, *J. of Geophys. Res.*, *105*, 26,695–26,711, 2000.
- 470 Kreslavsky, M., and J. Head, North-south topographic slope asymmetry on Mars:
- 471 Evidence for insolation-related erosion at high obliquity, *Geophys. Res. Let.*, *30*,
- 472 doi:10.1029/2003GL017795, 2003.

- 473 Kuzmin, R., N. Bobina, E. Zabulueva, and V. Shaskina, Inhomogeneities in the upper  
474 levels of the Martian cryolithosphere, *Lunar Planet. Sci. Conf., XIX*, 655–656, 1988.
- 475 Kuzmin, R., N. Bobina, E. Zabulueva, and V. Shaskina, Martian cryolithosphere: Struc-  
476 ture and relative ice content, *Int. Geol. Congr. Abs., 2*, 245, 1989.
- 477 Laskar, J., B. Levrard, and J. Mustard, Orbital forcing of the Martian polar layered  
478 deposits, *Nature*, *419*, 375–377, 2002.
- 479 Laskar, J., A. Correia, M. Gastineau, F. Joutel, B. Levrard, and P. Robutel, Long term  
480 evolution and chaotic diffusion of the insolation quantities of mars, *Icarus*, *170*, 343–  
481 364, 2004.
- 482 Mangold, N., and P. Allemand, Topographic analysis of features related to ice on Mars,  
483 *Geophys. Res. Let.*, *28*, 407–410, 2001.
- 484 Mangold, N., P. Allemand, P. Duval, Y. Geraud, and P. Thomas, Experimental and  
485 theoretical deformation of ice-rock mixtures: Implications of rheology and ice content  
486 of martian permafrost, *Planet. and Space Sci.*, *50*, 385–401, 2002.
- 487 Mellon, M., and B. Jakosky, The distribution and behavior of Martian ground ice during  
488 past and present epochs, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *100*, 11,781–11,799, 1995.
- 489 Mellon, M., B. Jakosky, and S. Postawko, The persistence of equatorial ground ice on  
490 Mars, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *102*, 19,357–19,369, 1997.
- 491 Milliken, R., J. Mustard, and D. Goldsby, Viscous flow feature on the surface of Mars:  
492 Observations from high-resolution Mars Oriter (MOC) images, *Nature*, *412*, 411–414,  
493 2001.
- 494 Mustard, J., C. Cooper, and M. Rifkin, Evidence for recent climate change on Mars from  
495 the identification of youthful near-surface ground ice, *Nature*, *412*, 411–414, 2001.

- 496 Paige, D., The thermal stability of near-surface ground ice on Mars, *Nature*, 356, 43–45,  
497 1992.
- 498 Parker, T., R. Saunders, and D. Schneeberger, Transitional morphology in the west  
499 Deuteronilus Mensae region of Mars: Implications for modification of the low-  
500 land/upland boundary, *Icarus*, 82, 111–145, 1989.
- 501 Parker, T., D. Gorsline, R. Saunders, and D. Schneeberger, Coastal geomorphology of the  
502 Martian northern plains, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 98, 11,061–11,078, 1993.
- 503 Pathare, A., D. Paige, and E. Turtle, Viscous relaxation of craters within the Martian  
504 south polar layered deposits, *Icarus*, 174, 396–418, 2005.
- 505 Perron, J., W. Dietrich, A. Howard, and J. McKean, Ice-driven creep on Martian debris  
506 slopes, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 30, doi:10.1029/2003GL017603, 2003.
- 507 Plaut, J., G. Picardi, A. Safaeinili, A. Ivanon, S. Milkovich, A. Cicchetti, W. Kofman, and  
508 J. Mouginot, Subsurface radar sounding of the south polar layered deposits of Mars,  
509 *Science*, 316, 92–95, 2007.
- 510 Smith, D., M. Zuber, H. Frey, J. Garvin, J. Head, D. Muhleman, G. Pettengill, and  
511 R. Phillips, Mars Orbiter Laser Altimeter: Experiment summary after the first year of  
512 global mapping of Mars, *Science*, 316, 92–95, 2001.
- 513 Strom, R., S. Croft, and N. Barlow, *The Martian impact cratering record*, pp. 383–421,  
514 The University of Arizona Press, 1992.
- 515 Ward, W., Climatic variation on mars. I. Astronomical theory of insolation, *J. Geophys.*  
516 *Res.*, 79, 3375–3386, 1974.

**Figure 1.** Local temperature of a horizontal surface on Mars as a function of latitude for the indicated obliquity state. Calculated using the method described in *Ward* [1974] and Section 2.3.

**Figure 2.** a) MOLA gridded topography of a 22 km diameter crater at 58.0°S, 156.5°E. Topographic contours are made every 100 m in elevation. Dotted lines indicate locations of radial profiles used to measure slope. b) Averaged topographic profiles for the northern crater face (dashed line) and the southern crater face (solid line). This crater has an asymmetry of  $A = 0.35$  (north face is steeper).

**Figure 3.** a) Simulation of 10 Myrs of topographic relaxation of a 25 km diameter crater at 25° latitude assuming a deformable layer 600 m in thickness with a 20% dust fraction. The final crater has a slope asymmetry of  $|A| = 0.3250$ . b) The temperature along the initial and final profiles varies due to the effect of slope on the angle of incident sunlight. The shift in the regional temperature between the two profiles is due to an obliquity of 34.5° 10 Myr ago compared to 25° present obliquity [*Laskar et al.*, 2002].

**Figure 4.** Numerical results of the crater asymmetry parameter ( $|A|$ ) as a function of latitude and  $\delta$ . These results assume a 30 km diameter crater, a 20% dust fraction, a 100 Myr relaxation period, and the indicated deformable layer thickness  $\delta$ .

**Figure 5.** Observed crater asymmetry measured at various latitudes (colored dots) compared to theoretical results (black curves) for varying creeping layer thicknesses ( $\delta$ ) with  $\phi=0.2$  over a 100 Myr period. The black squares and vertical lines indicate the mean asymmetry values and  $\pm 1$  standard deviation, respectively, for a particular latitude region. The dashed line shows results from simulations with a high dust fraction ( $\phi = 0.7$ ) and a 1.2 km thick deformable layer.

**Figure 6.** Asymmetry contours of  $|A| = 0.2$  given values for  $\delta$ ,  $\phi$ , and simulation duration. A crater diameter of 30 km, and a latitude of  $40^\circ$  were used in these simulations. The domain of  $|A| \leq 0.2$  for each simulation duration is indicated by the tick marks.

**Figure 7.** a) Simulation of 250 Myrs of topographic relaxation of a 25 km diameter crater at  $40^\circ$  latitude assuming a deformable layer 1200 m in thickness with a 50% dust fraction. The final crater has a slope asymmetry of  $|A| = 0.3973$ . b) The slope along the initial and final topographic profiles. c) The change in slope asymmetry ( $A$ ) over time. d) Obliquity variation over time using the statistical approach described in Section 2.3. We plotted obliquity every 100,000 yrs although it varied in the simulation every time step (1000 yrs).

**Figure 8.** a) Simulation results and observations of depth to diameter ( $d/D$ ) ratio plotted against  $A$ . This simulation lasts 250 Myr and is for a crater at  $25^\circ\text{S}$  latitude. The cross-hairs are separated by 25 Myr of simulation time;  $\delta=1200$  m and  $\phi=0.5$  in this simulation. The colored boxes give observed mean values for  $A$  and  $d/D$  ratio for a particular latitude region with  $\pm$  one standard deviation given by the error bars (Table 2). b)  $d/D$  ratio versus  $A$  plot for a crater relaxation simulation at  $60^\circ\text{S}$  using a  $\delta$  of 600 m and  $\phi$  of 0.5. Observations from  $60^\circ\text{S}$  and the negative of the mean  $A$  value for  $60^\circ\text{N}$  are plotted here in order to compare it with the southern latitude simulations. c) Similar plot for a simulation at  $25^\circ\text{S}$  with  $\delta=400$  m and  $\phi = 0.5$ . Observations from  $30$  and  $20^\circ\text{S}$  are shown for comparison.

**Table 1.** Definitions and measured or theoretical values (or range of values) for parameters used in the numerical simulations

Description	Symbol	Value(s)	Reference
activation energy	$Q$	50 kJ mol <sup>-1</sup>	[ <i>Goldsby and Kohlstedt, 2001</i> ]
reference viscosity	$\eta_o$	10 <sup>14</sup> Pa s	[ <i>Goldsby and Kohlstedt, 2001</i> ]
dust fraction	$\phi$	0.2–0.72	(upper limit) [ <i>Mangold et al., 2002</i> ]
dust frac. coeff.	$b$	8	[ <i>Pathare et al., 2005</i> ]
density of creep layer	$\rho$	1.07–2.01 g cm <sup>-3</sup>	based on $\phi$ , above
gravity	$g$	3.7 m s <sup>-2</sup>	

**Table 2.** Crater statistics for each region based on topographic observations <sup>a</sup>

Latitude	Longitude	# of Craters	$A$	Mean Diam (km)	Mean Depth (km)
58–63° N	0–360° E	27	0.02±0.19	26.1±6.4	1.01±0.41
0.25–2.75° S	30–70° E	11	–0.17±0.39	28.0±8.7	0.67±0.29
18–22° S	330–360° E	13	–0.155±0.28	29.8±8.1	1.15±0.34
28–35° S	130–150° E	23	–0.134±0.29	29.6±8.9	1.16±0.56
58–63° S	130–170° E	23	–0.07±0.25	29.9±7.1	0.91±0.36

<sup>a</sup> Errors are ± 1 standard deviation.